

BOARD OF REVIEW “IQ”

[True or False...You Decide] with citations from the 2011 Guide to Advancement

1 T F The Board of Review is the final opportunity for the troop’s adult leaders to re-test the Scout, to make certain he’s mastered the skills and learnings of the requirements for the rank he’s seeking.

FALSE – a Board of Review is not a retest. (8.0.1.1)

2 T F It’s the responsibility of the Eagle rank Board of Review to approve the manner in which the candidate’s service project was carried out.

TRUE (8.0.3.0)

3 T F The Scoutmaster’s vote, in a Board of Review, carries the same “weight” as all others.

FALSE – The Scoutmaster is not part of a Board of Review except to introduce the candidate. (8.0.0.3)

4 T F Only registered BSA adult volunteers can be members of an Eagle rank Board of Review.

FALSE – They need not be on an advancement committee or registered with the BSA but must have an understanding of the rank and purpose of the BOR. (8.0.3.0)

5 T F A group Board of Review can be conducted for multiple Scouts simultaneously, so long as they’re all candidates for the same rank.

FALSE – While the Guide to Advancement does not contain a specific prohibition on group boards of review, the language refers to “a Scout” or “the Scout”. It also states that any notes taken during a board of review must be kept confidential, categorically excluding what happens from being disclosed to others including other Scouts who are up for the same rank.

6 T F If a Scout fails his Board of Review, he can re-test with the Board after 3 or 6 months (depending on rank) of active participation.

FALSE -A Scout does not “fail” a board of review. He is informed of any deficiencies found and given an opportunity to correct them. The board is suspended and re-convened at a later date – no time limit is specified. If a board decides not to approve a candidate for advancement, he has the right to appeal to the council advancement committee. (8.0.1.5)

7 T F The BSA guidelines for advancement requirements represent the minimum standards for ranks and merit badges—The troop’s leaders set the final standards.

FALSE – No unit or individual has the authority to add to or subtract from advancement requirements. (Page 2)

8 T F It’s important for the troop to manage rank advancements and merit badges carefully, so that all Scouts of similar age advance together, and no Scout feels “left behind.”

FALSE – A Scout advances at his own pace and is promptly recognized for his achievement. He is not “held back” for the sake of others. (4.2.1.0 et.seq.)

9 T F Scoutmasters are members of Boards of Review so that, among other reasons, their vote can break any ties among the other Board members.

FALSE – See item 3 above. Furthermore, board members do not “vote” - consent must be unanimous.

10 T F The Board of Review can help to slow down Scouts who advance too rapidly, so that with increased maturity they can appreciate the significance of the new rank better.

FALSE – See item 8 above and 4.2.0.1.

11 T F Boards of Review cannot be held after a Scout's 18th birthday.

FALSE – The Guide explicitly states that an Eagle candidate's board of review can be held after his 18th birthday (8.0.3.1). Since for the lower ranks, the board of review date is the effective date of advancement, it is implicit that the board of review for Tenderfoot through Life must be held prior to his 18th birthday.

12 T F Any adult who has a son registered in the troop is eligible to be a Board of Review member.

TRUE – Boards of review for Tenderfoot through Life should be composed of registered committee members, but where fewer than three committee members are available, knowledgeable parents or other adults may participate. A parent may never participate in his own son's board of review. (8.0.2.0)

13 T F Scouts must be in full and correct uniform in order to participate in a board of review.

FALSE – While it is preferred that a Scout be in full field uniform, a board of review cannot reject a candidate because he's not in uniform, nor may they require purchase of a uniform or specific clothing such as a coat and tie. (8.0.0.4)

14 T F A board of review represents an opportunity for the troop's committee to learn how well the troop's adult leaders are delivering the Scouting program to its youth.

TRUE (8.0.1.3)

15 T F When a merit badge is earned through a Merit Badge Counselor not associated with the troop, the board of review should be sure to ascertain the extent to which the skills and/or knowledge required by the merit badge were learned by the Scout.

FALSE – Unit leadership does not have the authority to retract approval or take the badge away once it has been approved by a registered merit badge counselor. (7.0.4.6) However, any suspicions about whether a particular counselor has followed the requirements should be brought up to the district or council advancement committee.

From Ask Andy - <http://netcommissioner.com/askandy/2008/06/issue-135-june-3-2008/>
Responses and notes by Frank Maynard 12 Jan 2012